

# 11

## Slavery and Prostitution

### *A Twenty-First-Century Abolitionist Perspective*

**Melissa Farley**

Farley, M. (2015) *Slavery and Prostitution: a 21st Century Abolitionist Perspective*. In Bonnie Martin and James F. Brooks (eds.) *Linking the Histories of Slavery in North America and Its Borderlands*. Santa Fe: School for Advanced Research Press.

A turning point in the British abolitionist movement was the publication of a now iconic diagram of a slave ship that transported slaves from Ghana to England.<sup>1</sup> The drawing shows slaves stacked like sardines, 482 human beings packed into the hull of the ship. It was a factual diagram carefully drawn to scale. This powerful image sparked outrage in the public. To the slave owners and traders, the image was unanswerable. Overwhelmingly, the public responded: How can we abolish slavery?

I know of places like that ship—in 2008 a California pimp transported young women, also lined up like sardines, in the trunk of his car, popping the trunk open for sex buyers to see what he had for sale.<sup>2</sup> One of the young women who had been in that car was the fourth generation of women in her family who had been prostituted. She had grown up with homelessness, drug abuse, racism, incest, sexualization as a child and sexual assaults by neighbors and family, overwhelming community violence, physical abuse, emotional and physical neglect, a lack of educational resources, a lack of employment opportunities, a lack of social services or legal protection, and a lack of mental health services. Because she wanted to escape her captors, she tried to get arrested by soliciting for prostitution in front of police stations. By the time she was eighteen, eight pimps had traded her, including two who put their tattooed symbols of ownership on her body (figure 11.1).



**FIGURE 11.1**

*Woman pulling down her lip to show a tattoo of the name of her pimp, Richey. (Amita Sharma, KPBS, 2011)*

According to many research studies that will be noted here, slavery and pimp-controlled prostitution are the same experience *from the perspective of the enslaved or prostituted*. The abuses of power in prostitution and the abuses of power in slavery, discussed here, are profound social injustices resulting in great harm.<sup>3</sup> The same arguments that justified the abolition of slavery also justify the abolition of prostitution. Pimps and traffickers are traders who own and enslave human beings. Sex buyers purchase these people, exploiting and abusing them. The adverse consequences resulting from harms inflicted by sex buyers on the women they use, rent, or own are discussed here. The inequalities and harms in prostitution are paralleled by inequalities and harms in relationships between slave owners and slaves. In the 1800s, conditions in the South and in the Atlantic African slave trade were so inhumane that they precipitated an international movement for emancipation and for abolition of legal slavery. Today, the same kinds of abuse have ignited a similar movement to abolish the global business of prostitution. As in the nineteenth century, the legal definition of slavery is today debated in some quarters, including whether or not an understanding of slavery should be applied to prostitution. The challenges of defining,

understanding, and abolishing prostitution are compounded by the resistance of pimps, sex buyers, and organized criminals who campaign to romanticize or deny the realities of prostitution. In the nineteenth century, similar struggles were waged among slave owners, slave buyers, and abolitionists.

Trafficking and modern-day pimping have parallels not only in the chattel slavery practiced by the colonists of North America but also in the enslavement of indigenous women. Captive taking in warfare or civil conflict, usually with a focus on female captives, has been practiced throughout history.<sup>4</sup> While the hostages/slaves offered by Powhatan, the father of Pocahontas, to the British colonists are familiar, less so is the British offering to Powhatan of an English youth who was probably an indentured servant or temporary slave.<sup>5</sup> Like today's sales of young women by marriage brokers,<sup>6</sup> the prostitution of Native women by colonists who were engaged in the fur trade or military, and who often had wives in Europe, was a result of poverty and sexism on all sides.<sup>7</sup> James Brooks has described the enslavement and sale of peoples by both Native Americans and European Americans. At the heart of these reciprocal practices of slavery in the Southwest was the sexism of both indigenous and Spanish men. Control and ownership of women and children were proof of social status.<sup>8</sup> Although captives were sometimes adopted or married in the captor's culture, the experience of the captive remains very much like that of the enslaved. Similarly, pimps marry prostituted women in order to extend their control over them and to produce children. Just as the market for and trade in captives in Native American and New Mexican societies provided lower-status slavers the opportunity to accumulate power and prestige,<sup>9</sup> so, also, gang-controlled prostitution allows lower-status members of the culture, often ethnically marginalized men, the opportunity for significant financial gains. Some members of the Chinook and the Clatsop nations pimped enslaved women to colonists on the Northwest coast of the United States.<sup>10</sup>

## **THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SELLER/MASTER AND ENSLAVED AND BETWEEN PIMP/SEX BUYER AND PROSTITUTED**

### **Domination and Dehumanization**

There are many parallels between slavery and prostitution. Prostitution is an institution of male dominance, just as transatlantic slavery was an institution of white European racial dominance. Racism drove the objectification and dehumanization of enslaved Africans, just as sexism drives the objectification and dehumanization in prostitution. Both institutions

commodify human beings. Women are permitted no dignity in slavery or in prostitution. The enslaved and the prostituted are marginalized and degraded in culturally tolerated rituals that conceal deadly violations of basic human rights. Over time, the humiliation and degradation produce a core sense of incapacitating shame in the enslaved or prostituted person.

The viewpoints of buyers can be enlightening. For example, a twentieth-century planter said, "We used to own our slaves, now we just rent them,"<sup>11</sup> while a Nevada pimp described the temporary ownership of prostitution as being "like the time-share of a vacation home."<sup>12</sup> Prostitution can also be understood as renting a woman's vagina, breasts, anus, and mouth. Sex buyers' attitudes resemble those of slave buyers. Research interviews in which sex buyers were asked to define prostitution were revealing: "You get what you pay for without the 'no'"<sup>13</sup> and "It's like renting an organ for ten minutes."<sup>14</sup>

Women in both prostitution and slavery are commodities. Commodification requires objectification, changing people from humans into objects with economic value.<sup>15</sup> A pimp explained commodification at its most basic: "I took the kind of girl no one would miss so when they were resold, no one would look for them. It is as if I sold a kilo of bread."<sup>16</sup> In the same way, slave owners attributed characteristics to Africans that rationalized their intrinsic nonhumanity, thereby allowing the owners to justify any violence or abuse perpetrated against those they enslaved.

Commodification is eroticized in both slavery and prostitution. Sex buyers are aroused by the fact that they are buying or renting a "whore" who "willingly" degrades herself by submitting to her own sexual exploitation. "By taking money in exchange for sex, she strips herself of her own humanity and so 'legitimately' becomes nothing more than the embodiment of his masturbatory fantasy."<sup>17</sup> The temporary domination/ownership of a woman by a sex buyer is at the erotic core of prostitution. John Stoltenberg has suggested that possession is a centerpiece of men's sexual behavior.<sup>18</sup> Economic and sexual ownership bolsters masculinity. The intertwining of economics and sexuality in prostitution has many parallels in slavery. In reviewing letters between a slave trader and buyer from 1834, historian Edward Baptist analyzed the rape of slave women, their sexual commodification, and the fetishization of the slave trade. The economic and sexual passion for ownership of slaves was shared by traders and buyers alike. Baptist describes letters between men who owned an established slave-trading company in New Orleans and a slave buyer who was sexually obsessed with "mulatto" women slaves, that is, those women who were themselves the result of the rape of African women by slave owners. "Sexual fetishes and commodity fetishism intertwined with such intimacy that coerced sex was the secret meaning

of commerce in human beings.”<sup>19</sup> Slave sellers and buyers cataloged skin color in fetishistic detail.<sup>20</sup> Today sex buyers compulsively catalog details about women they buy for sex, criticizing, grading, and bragging about purchased sex via online chat boards.<sup>21</sup> Prostituted and enslaved women are forced to wear special clothing that identifies and advertises them.<sup>22</sup> If online technology had existed in the nineteenth century, slave traders would certainly have cataloged and advertised enslaved women to be sold for use in prostitution on the plantations or in brothels.

### **Profound Psychological and Physical Harm Resulting from Slavery and from Prostitution**

Women are nonpersons in prostitution. Payment of money in prostitution, as in slavery, releases the buyer from any obligation to treat the bought person as human. A prostituted girl said, “Prostitution makes me feel like I am nothing, nothing at all.”<sup>23</sup> To slave traders and owners, the black woman was “a fragmented commodity whose feelings and choices were rarely considered: her head and her heart were separated from...her womb and vagina.”<sup>24</sup> The dehumanization and objectification intrinsic to enslavement and to prostitution result in a psychologically traumatized status that has accurately been described as social death.<sup>25</sup> The acts perpetrated on a woman in prostitution define her as a degraded object, as “cunt,” as “filthy whore.” Her self, her individuality, her humanity are systematically attacked and destroyed in prostitution. She is reduced to vagina, anus, breasts, and mouth. She acts the part of what men want her to be.<sup>26</sup> The only “plausible line in the...film *Pretty Woman*,” said a prostituted woman, “is when Richard Gere, playing a client, asks Julia Roberts, playing a prostitute, what her name is, and she replies, ‘Anything you want it to be.’”<sup>27</sup> Enslaved people at auctions said what they thought the slave traders and the slave buyers wanted to hear. “In the slave pens, the ethereal fantasies of the slaveholding regime were daily converted into the material shape of sold slaves.”<sup>28</sup> The commodification that exists in the minds of traders, pimps, sex buyers, and slave buyers is ultimately incorporated into the identity of the prostituted or enslaved person. As a woman in strip club prostitution explained, “You start changing yourself to fit a fantasy role of what they think a woman should be. In the real world, these women don’t exist. They stare at you with this starving hunger. It sucks you dry; you become this empty shell. They’re not really looking at you. You’re not you. You’re not even there.”<sup>29</sup>

Degradation and humiliation are central to the experience of women in prostitution and slavery. Nonslaves had difficulty understanding the

MELISSA FARLEY

depths of slavery's degradation, according to former slave Harriet Jacobs.<sup>30</sup> Similarly, prostitution survivor and author Claude Jaget described the shattering experience of being selected from a brothel lineup:

I'd freeze up inside.... It was horrible, they'd look you up and down. That moment, when you felt them looking at you, sizing you up, judging you...and those men, those fat pigs who weren't worth half as much as the worst of us, they'd joke, make comments.... They made you turn and face in all directions, because of course a front view wasn't enough for them. It used to make me furious, but at the same time I was panic-stricken, I didn't dare speak. I wasn't physically frightened, but it shook my confidence. I felt really [demeaned].... I was the thing he came and literally bought. He had judged me like he'd judge cattle at a fairground, and that's revolting, it's sickening, it's terrible for the women. You can't imagine it if you've never been through it yourself.<sup>31</sup>

The brothel lineup is reminiscent of the terror of the auction block.<sup>32</sup> Women who have survived prostitution say that the experience is so degrading, it is as if one becomes "a kind of human toilet."<sup>33</sup> In the language of the times, an enslaved woman explained that "a slave woman ain't allowed to respect herself."<sup>34</sup> Upon refusal to permit sexual assault by the owner, one sixteen-year-old was sent from the mid-Atlantic to a southern state, where she was worked to death.<sup>35</sup>

High rates of death from homicide are documented among slaves and among those in prostitution. Chronic health problems of enslaved and prostituted women were a result of overwhelming stress, untreated health problems, sexual assault, battering, and torture. A prostituted woman said:

I've had three broken arms, nose broken twice, and I'm partially deaf in one ear.... I have a small fragment of a bone floating in my head that gives me migraines. I've had a fractured skull. My legs ain't worth shit no more; my toes have been broken. My feet, bottom of my feet, have been burned; they've been whopped with a hot iron and clothes hanger...the hair on my pussy had been burned off at one time...I have scars. I've been cut with a knife, beat with guns, two by fours. There hasn't been a place on my body that hasn't been bruised somehow, some way, some big, some small.<sup>36</sup>

In 1872 a witness described Ku Klux Klan members torturing a young African American woman using nearly identical methods:

She stated—and I even saw the marks—that she had been whipped on her body and limbs. She also stated that while she was prostrate on the floor, one of them lit a match and burned the hair from her private parts.<sup>37</sup>

Neglect and malnutrition resulted in chronic health problems and reduced life expectancy for women in prostitution and slavery. Unsanitary living conditions, inadequate nutrition, and unrelenting hard labor created a susceptibility to disease.<sup>38</sup> Malnutrition increases susceptibility to infectious diseases and diseases of poverty, such as tuberculosis.<sup>39</sup> US slaves had a life expectancy of about thirty years.<sup>40</sup> Among those in prostitution, similar conditions—overexertion, stress, poor nutrition, and sleeplessness—create parallel vulnerability to illnesses. Like slave masters, pimps control the diets of those in prostitution. The leading causes of death among the enslaved in Virginia in 1850 were respiratory diseases, tuberculosis, nervous system disease, typhoid, diarrhea, and cholera.<sup>41</sup> Common medical problems of women in prostitution include tuberculosis, diabetes, cancer, arthritis, tachycardia, malaria, asthma, anemia, hepatitis, uterine infections, menstrual problems, ovarian pain, abortion complications, pregnancy, hepatitis B, hepatitis C, infertility, syphilis, and HIV.<sup>42</sup>

In slavery and in prostitution, the pain of relentless verbal abuse humiliates, degrades, and causes lasting emotional damage. Enslaved in nineteenth-century North Carolina, Harriet Jacobs wrote, “For my master, whose restless, craving, vicious nature roved about day and night, seeking whom to devour, had just left me, with stinging, scorching words; words that scathed ear and brain like fire. O how I despised him.”<sup>43</sup> Using drugs and alcohol to mitigate the pain of the verbal assaults from sex buyers, a woman said, “You get extra extra high so you don’t have to deal with those words they call you. They hurt so much, if it was a knife, it would cut you.”<sup>44</sup> A survivor’s description of the psychological damage of prostitution also applies to slavery: “It is internally damaging. You become in your own mind what these people do and say with you. You wonder how could you let yourself do this and why do these people want to do this to you?”<sup>45</sup>

Coerced rejection of family and community ties are tools of domination and control in slavery and in prostitution. Pimps convince young women who are already likely to be alienated from or abused by their families that the family is the enemy and not to be trusted. The woman’s attachments to family and friends are carefully undermined and ultimately destroyed, leaving the pimp as the only available source of support, protection, or validation. In slavery the destruction of family bonds was also brutal. The ability to separate families at will was at the heart of the social and



**FIGURE 11.2**

*Bar code on woman's wrist. (Spanish National Police, 2012)*

economic power of the slave buyers and traders.<sup>46</sup> Family members, parents, husbands, and children were sold to different owners.

Change of name is a ritual of enslavement.<sup>47</sup> In prostitution, names also change, along with a new hypersexualized identity. A mark of servitude could be inflicted on the slave, just as pimps and traffickers routinely tattoo their marks on women in prostitution. A Spanish trafficking ring inflicted a bar code branding/tattoo on a woman who tried to escape.<sup>48</sup> She was also beaten. The bar code symbol functioned as the young woman's coerced identity and as a certificate of ownership by a prostitution ring (figure 11.2).

Slave owners' and prostitute buyers' fantasies about slavery and prostitution drive the real lives of those enslaved or prostituted. Planters sometimes mimed the conventions of romance, enabling them to temporarily forget that they owned slaves.<sup>49</sup> Sex buyers today seek a "girlfriend experience" in which prostituted women are paid to mimic a love relationship. The performance is required to be one that fools the sex buyer. From the moment of sale, the purchased or rented person is measured against the buyer's fantasies—the "happy, hardworking Negro from New Orleans" or



“the prostitute who loves to have sex with strangers.” Failure to live up to these fantasies led to brutal beatings by slave owners. Violence by slave owners was

the natural result of slaveholders’ inevitable failure to live through the stolen bodies of their slaves. In the face of the frailty or resistance of those whom they had bought—publicly caught between their own fantasies of self-amplification and the reality of their dependence—slaveholders often responded with shocking brutality.<sup>50</sup>

Similar failures led to similar violence by sex buyers who rationalized:

When there is violence, it is mostly the prostitute’s fault. See, I am going to buy something. If I am satisfied with what I am buying, then why should I be violent? I will be violent when I am cheated, when I am offered a substandard service.... Sometimes violence is because the prostitute wants the client to use condoms. They force it on the client. He will naturally be disgruntled and there will be altercations.<sup>51</sup>

Suicidal thoughts and actual suicide are consequences of slavery and of prostitution. In two studies at an agency that assisted women in prostitution, a majority of women had made suicide attempts.<sup>52</sup> Equating prostitution with death, one woman stated, “Why commit suicide? I’ll work in prostitution instead.”<sup>53</sup> Some of the factors that have been connected with suicide by the enslaved include kidnapping, rape and other physical brutality, starvation, family separation, violation of religious beliefs, and unendurable physical pain.<sup>54</sup> Violence, the threat of violence, and psychological coercion ensure that the enslaved and the prostituted do not escape. Today’s pimps, like transatlantic slave owners, have bounty hunters to capture women who try to escape.<sup>55</sup> But physical violence is not required for controlling women in prostitution. “They come to perceive their situation not as a deliberate action taken to harm them but as part of the normal, if regrettable, scheme of things.”<sup>56</sup> The violent control used by pimps causes feelings not only of terror but also of helplessness and dependence. A prostituted trafficking victim in the United Kingdom explained, “Sometimes I don’t see the point in doing anything. It seems useless. When someone has controlled you and made decisions for you for so long, you can’t do that for yourself anymore.”<sup>57</sup> This same dynamic existed in slavery, with contemporary historians noting the vacant look of despair in the eyes of the enslaved as she was about to be sold.<sup>58</sup>

**MELISSA FARLEY**

Mental control is accelerated by social isolation and sensory deprivation, which can include being locking up victims for long periods of time in windowless rooms to keep them disoriented about time and place, deprived of sunlight, and more vulnerable to the pimp's or master's influence. The social isolation may be so profoundly stressful and disorganizing that the victim will acquiesce to any form of contact, even rape.<sup>59</sup> Pimps and slave owners deliberately traumatize women and children in order to establish control over them. They use starvation, sleep deprivation, protein deprivation, unexpected sexual violence, and learned helplessness.<sup>60</sup> The pimp's total control over young women in prostitution includes what she wears, when and where she can sleep, what and how much she can eat, whether she can use a toilet or access menstrual supplies, if and how much emergency medical care she receives, even how much air and light she is allowed to have. The same survival needs were similarly controlled and manipulated by slave owners.

Coercive subjugation in slavery or prostitution always contains the threat of violence, which is periodically inflicted under conditions that maximize its effects: unpredictably and with an overwhelming intensity. Any move toward autonomy, any attempt on the part of the woman to exert more control over her body or even to use her own critical thinking, is viewed as insubordination.<sup>61</sup> Whenever violence is not inflicted on her, the enslaved or prostituted person is grateful. This coerced gratitude is an essential element of the pimp-prostitute or master-slave relationship. Although it is a dynamic of domination and subordination, it is nonetheless an intimate relationship. Emotional bonding to an abuser under conditions of captivity has been described as "the Stockholm syndrome."<sup>62</sup> Attitudes and behaviors that are part of this syndrome include intense gratefulness for small favors when the captor holds life-and-death power over the captive, denial of the extent of violence and harm that the captor has inflicted or is obviously capable of inflicting, hypervigilance with respect to the captor's needs, identification with the captor's perspective on the world (an example of this was kidnapped heiress Patty Hearst's identification with her captors' ideology), the perception of those trying to assist in escape as enemies and the perception of captors as friends, and extreme difficulty leaving one's captor/pimp even after physical release has occurred.<sup>63</sup> Paradoxically, women in prostitution or enslaved women may feel that they owe their lives to pimps or to slave owners (figure 11.3).

Enslaved women were sold by slave traders who functioned as pimps to plantation owners for sexual use by the slave master, his friends, and his family. Traders wrote of a "great demand for fancy maids," that is, enslaved



**FIGURE 11.3**

*A woman reveals a tattoo showing that she was owned by King Koby, the alias of her pimp, Vincent George, who was convicted of promoting prostitution and money laundering in 2013. (Anthony Delmundo, New York Daily News, 2013)*

women who were sold as prostitutes to pimps who ran brothels.<sup>64</sup> Light-skinned women—born of rapes by slave owners—were valued as prostitutes and domestically trafficked. Commenting on this, a South Carolina man said, “The availability of slave women for sex avoided the horrors of prostitution...men could satisfy their sexual needs while increasing their slave property.”<sup>65</sup> Slaves were also exploited as wet nurses and substitute mothers.

Slave owners benefited from slaves’ impregnation because children born to slave women became slaves themselves. After the United States banned the importing of slaves in 1808, the breeding of enslaved women became big business, with some plantations devoted exclusively to the heinous practice.<sup>66</sup>

They would buy a fine girl and a fine man and just put them

together like cattle.... If she was a good breeder, they was proud of her.... I had an aunt in Mississippi and she had about twenty children by her marster.<sup>67</sup>

The harvesting of children from women in prostitution in order to produce the next generation of “sex workers” parallels the breeding of slaves. Rapes of prostituted women confer similar economic benefits on pimps, some of whom deliberately impregnate women. Prostitution survivors have described breeding programs run by trafficking syndicates. By “raising his own ho,” one pimp said, he created a population of the most malleable prostitutes, since he was able to control them from birth onward.<sup>68</sup> The adult woman is easier to control via her child and is an easy target for threats, blackmail, and coerced choices of all kinds.

### **Torture**

Torture is “any act by which severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person for such purposes as punishing him...or intimidating or coercing him or a third person, or for any reason based on discrimination of any kind.”<sup>69</sup> According to recent definitions, torture can be a private event, as well as one that is state sponsored. There are many accounts of women’s torture under slavery<sup>70</sup> and under prostitution.<sup>71</sup> Most of the psychological, sexual, and physical coercion used by slave owners and pimps meets legal definitions of torture.<sup>72</sup>

As in slavery, the use of well-known torture methods ensures that women will comply with any demands of sex buyers or pimps. Specific acts commonly perpetrated against prostituted women are the same acts that define torture: forced nudity, sexual mocking, rape, verbal sexual harassment, physical sexual harassment, and not permitting basic hygiene. In California, a girl described pimps’ torture methods:

When a pimp says he’s going to torture you, what I’ve seen is girls in dog cages, girls being waterboarded, stripped down naked and put in the rain and cold outside and having to stand there all night, and if you move, you’ll get beaten. I’ve seen girls get hit by cars and stunned with stun guns.... I’ve seen girls burned and strangled.<sup>73</sup>

Enforced nudity in slavery, torture, and prostitution is not only humiliating, it also marks its victims with shame, dehumanization, and vulnerability to rape.<sup>74</sup> Rape is used in torture and in prostitution as the primary method of control. The intimate, aggressive domination of rape drives home the massive inequality between the dominator and the subordinated. Describing

the utter destruction of dignity and self, a man told Human Rights Watch that prison rape was “being made into a person of no self-worth, re-made into whatever the person or the gang doing the raping wants you to be.”<sup>75</sup> In 2001, rape was designated a crime against humanity by the International Criminal Court. In prostitution or slavery, rape must be understood as an act of torture that has the goal of dominating an entire class of people.<sup>76</sup>

The same sexual humiliation used in slavery and in state-sponsored torture is inflicted in prostitution. Historian Joanna Bourke described the photographs of US military torture at Abu Ghraib:

Torture aims to undermine the way the victim relates to his or her own self, and thus threatens to dissolve the mainsprings of an individual’s personality.... The sexual nature of these acts shows that the torturers realise the centrality of sexuality for their victims’ identity. The perpetrators in these photographs aim to destroy their victim’s sense of self by inflicting and recording extreme sexual humiliation.<sup>77</sup>

Many viewed this torture of prisoners by the United States at Abu Ghraib with shock and horror, yet when the same acts are paid for by men who use prostituted women, torture is redefined as sexual entertainment.

### **CHOICE VERSUS CHOICELESSNESS AND LAWS REGARDING SLAVERY AND PROSTITUTION**

Slavery removes freedom and imposes choicelessness, backed up by violence or the threat of violence. The elements of slavery are present in the relationship between pimps/traffickers and those they prostitute, including gross power inequity, physical abuse, and lack of free will.<sup>78</sup> Yet some assert that most adult women in prostitution freely consent to it.<sup>79</sup> Others point out that if a woman in prostitution is physically or mentally controlled by a pimp, then she is enslaved and without freedom. According to a survey of eighteen sources, including research studies and both governmental and nongovernmental reports, on average, 84 percent of all women in prostitution are pimped, trafficked, or under the control of third parties.<sup>80</sup> Two research studies found that while 89 to 90 percent of women wanted to escape prostitution, they did not feel free to exit, because of a lack of alternatives for survival.<sup>81</sup> One man explained:

I don’t think prostitution is quite the same as rape. Rape is worse. But it’s close to the rape end of the spectrum. It’s not rape, because there is superficial consent.... On the face of it, the prostitute is agreeing to it. But deeper down, you can see that

**MELISSA FARLEY**

life circumstances have kind of forced her into that.... It's like someone jumping from a burning building—you could say they made their choice to jump, but you could also say they had no choice.<sup>82</sup>

Prostitution has been described as “the choice made by those who have no choice.”<sup>83</sup> A woman in a Nevada legal brothel said, “No one really enjoys being sold. It's like you sign a contract to be raped.”<sup>84</sup> Another woman characterized Dutch legal prostitution as “volunteer slavery.”<sup>85</sup> The pimp, trafficker, or slave owner behind the practice remains invisible. Studying histories of captive taking, Cameron noted that “the distinction between voluntary (and likely desperate) refugee and violently acquired captive is difficult to discern.”<sup>86</sup>

Less visible factors contribute to women's enslavement. Hunger combined with a lack of education or job training can compel a woman into prostitution, from which it then becomes difficult, if not impossible, to escape. Poor women in United States prostitution exchanged sex acts for hamburgers<sup>87</sup> and gas money.<sup>88</sup> The more financially desperate she is and the more her life has been limited by racist inequality or by sexual assaults, then the less freedom she has and the more limited her resources for escape from prostitution. Yet a debate wages over whether hunger and sexism are factors that coerce women into prostitution.

Throughout history, poverty and sexism and racism have compelled prostitution, as in the dire situation of starving Coos women in 1850 in what is now southern Oregon. Historian Gray Whaley describes the context of their prostitution:

A broad range of colonial activities decimated traditional economic activities such as mining sluices, which clogged and polluted streams, inhibiting fish runs and spawning activity, and raising cattle, which trampled and devoured camas fields. Some Native bands literally faced starvation as a result. In this desperate state some Indian women prostituted themselves for food and, increasingly, whiskey.<sup>89</sup>

This lack of alternatives for survival is a crucial element of slavery.

In interpreting the Thirteenth Amendment in contemporary peonage contexts, courts have been far less concerned with whether the condition was voluntarily entered and far more with whether the subsequent service was involuntary. That victims believe they have no viable alternative but to serve in the ways

in which they are being forced has also supported a finding of coercion, and with it the conclusion that the condition is one of enslavement. Involuntary servitude has embraced situations in which a person has made a difficult but rational decision to remain in bondage.<sup>90</sup>

Many of the factors described by Whaley as affecting Coos women in 1850 have a devastating impact on the lives of Native women today. Native women continue to be trafficked into prostitution. Ninety eight percent of 105 Native prostituted women in a 2011 Minnesota study were currently or previously homeless. Most had been raped and had suffered violent physical assaults. A majority of these women saw a connection between their history of colonization and present-day sexual colonization in prostitution.<sup>91</sup> As noted by Sarah Deer in chapter 10 of this volume, their trafficking by the United States government and others has been misnamed “relocation” and has not been recognized as trafficking.

When there is a failure to understand the lack of choice, slaves have been blamed for their own enslavement, children have been blamed for being sexually abused, Jews have been blamed for not escaping the death camps, and women in prostitution have been blamed for having made a choice to be prostituted. Philosopher Elaine Scarry, who has written about physical and mental pain, torture, and war, explained:

It is a universal fate of those from whom the power to author their own fate has been retracted that later populations attribute to them the power of authorship and speak of them as “permitting” it.<sup>92</sup>

Because of the human need to name something in order to understand and then challenge it, one cannot fight slavery unless it is named slavery.<sup>93</sup> Harriet Jacobs wrote, “The secrets of slavery are concealed like the Inquisition.”<sup>94</sup> Some human rights observers who go to Mauritania see people whom they understand to be working in the fields in exchange for food and shelter, rather than intergenerational slaves.<sup>95</sup>

As in the Mauritanian example, slavery exists in multiple configurations. Its original definition in the United States included unjust domination and subordination by either the state or private parties. Chattel slavery was simply the most extreme form of slavery. It is important to understand slavery and prostitution from the perspective of the enslaved and the prostituted and not only via legal definitions, which can be excessively restrictive. Slavery is characterized by control of movement, control of the physical environment, psychological control, measures taken to prevent or deter escape,

force, threat of force or coercion, assertion of exclusivity, subjection to cruel treatment and abuse, control of sexuality, and forced labor.<sup>96</sup> These modes of control are also characteristic of pimp and sex buyer relationships with women in prostitution. Slavery-like conditions coexist with slavery as it has been legally defined. An undocumented agricultural worker in the United States said, “First, you had slaves. Then you had freed slaves. Then you had poor whites and sharecroppers. Now you have immigrants. It is all part of a continuum we have to break.”<sup>97</sup> A Thirteenth Amendment scholar noted that “social movements in the nineteenth century were sometimes more honest than Americans today in recognizing unfreedom in bedrock institutions of market and family and daring to call this unfreedom slavery.”<sup>98</sup>

In 1865 the Thirteenth Amendment legally abolished slavery and involuntary servitude, which were defined as “legal or physical force, used or threatened, to secure service, which must be distinctly personal service... in which one person possesses virtually unlimited authority over another.” All of the forms of coercion recognized under the Thirteenth Amendment are common in prostitution, such as being deprived of food, sleep, and money, being beaten, and being raped, tortured, and threatened with death.<sup>99</sup> Vulnerabilities that have been recognized as contributing to coercion include mental retardation, poverty, being undocumented, and not speaking the dominant language.<sup>100</sup> A Florida state law that provides civil remedies for damages inflicted by sex buyers and pimps against prostituted women articulates these vulnerabilities. Women who are coerced into prostitution via exploitation of their social vulnerability can sue sex buyers and pimps for damages. Coercion is defined in the Florida law as restraint of speech or communication with others or exploitation of a condition of developmental disability, cognitive limitation, affective disorder, or substance dependence; exploitation of prior victimization by sexual abuse; exploitation during the making of pornography; and exploitation of the human needs for food, shelter, safety, or affection.<sup>101</sup>

Referring to trafficking in persons as modern slavery, the US Department of State further specified that trafficking includes obtaining or holding a person in compelled service, forced labor, sex trafficking, bonded labor, and debt bondage.<sup>102</sup> The US Department of Justice prohibited involuntary servitude, making it unlawful to “hold a person in a condition of slavery, that is, a condition of compulsory service or labor against his/her will.”<sup>103</sup> To be convicted under this law, “the victim must be held against his/her will by actual force, threats of force, or threats of legal coercion.” Additionally, Section 1584 “prohibits compelling a person to work against his/her will by creating a ‘climate of fear’ through the use of force,



the threat of force, or the threat of legal coercion which is sufficient to compel service against a person's will."<sup>104</sup> A shortcoming of this law is its failure to mention prostitution that is under the control of a third party such as a pimp or trafficker. Today's abolitionists define trafficking as any form of prostitution controlled by a third party such as people commonly defined as pimps, but they can also be pornographers, strip club managers, or escort agency operators if these persons exercise ownership-like control over their victims.<sup>105</sup>

Some international laws that address prostitution's lack of freedom and choice strongly oppose prostitution and trafficking.<sup>106</sup> Understanding trafficked women to be victims, not criminals, the 2000 Palermo Protocol made consent irrelevant to determining whether trafficking has occurred and encouraged states to develop legislative responses to men's demand for prostitution. The protocol stated that payment of money for prostitution is a means of coercing a person into being sexually used, and it closed loopholes that had been used to define prostitution and trafficking as labor.<sup>107</sup> The International Criminal Court (ICC) in 1998 named enslavement a crime against humanity. The ICC statute defines enslavement as "the exercise of any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership over a person [including] the exercise of such power in the course of trafficking in persons, in particular women and children."<sup>108</sup> A 2006 report by the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights Aspects of the Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, noted that prostitution as it is practiced in the world "usually satisfies the legal elements for the definition of trafficking" and therefore legalization of prostitution is "to be discouraged."<sup>109</sup> Supporting this observation, a study of trafficking in 150 countries has shown that where prostitution is legalized, trafficking increases.<sup>110</sup> Using someone in prostitution, the special rapporteur observed, was "directly inflicting an additional and substantial harm upon the trafficking victim, tantamount to rape, above and beyond the harmful means used by others to achieve her entry or maintenance in prostitution." Targeting the sex buyer, the 1999 Swedish law on prostitution imposed strong penalties on the person buying sex but decriminalized the person being sold (the prostituted) and provided for exit support and services. This focus on the sex buyer—assumed to be the driver of the sex trafficking industry—has resulted in Sweden's low rate of trafficking.<sup>111</sup>

How can slavery be distinguished from harsh and exploitive employment? Proposing that we consider the socioeconomic and gender-based foundations of relationships that are *de facto* slavery, attorney Rachel Harris and policy analyst Katharine Gelber explain that "slavery exists

where individuals inhabit powerless subject positions, positions which exist within a complicit, if not actively exploitative, international community.<sup>112</sup> Australian courts, they note, have struggled to define the extent of the similarity between pimping and trafficking, on the one hand, and chattel slavery, on the other. Section 270.1 of the Australian Criminal Code defines slavery as “the condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised, including where such a condition results from a debt or contract made by the person.”<sup>113</sup>

The diverse forms of domination and coercion have resulted in some unfortunate rankings of “real slavery” above practices defined as “not-quite-slavery.” For example, although most prostitution includes choicelessness, Skinner contrasted “real” slavery, where physical force is used, with presumably “fake” slavery, in which hunger, abuse, brainwashing by pimps, lifetimes of lethal racism, and sexism drive women into prostitution.<sup>114</sup> These crushing oppressions are dismissed as factors compelling prostitution. I once had an argument with a US government official at a postconference reception. “Oh come on,” he said, “you mean to tell me that you *don't think* high-priced escorts on silk sheets at the Hyatt Regency have it pretty good?” It is my experience that he is not alone in this naïve perception. The paid rapes of prostitution are camouflaged by a coerced smile, a silk sheet, and a hotel with a familiar name. The public and sex buyers alike are taken in by pimps' advertising: pay more for high-priced escorts on satin sheets, with this subtext: they are making lots of money, and they are happy. Survivors of prostitution have made it clear that alleged high-class prostitution is deeply abusive and often controlled by organized crime, as in the case of Stella Marr, described below, who was controlled by Mafia pimps in a brothel in New York. Much of the business of prostitution today is controlled by organized crime operating globally—for example, from Poland to the United Kingdom, from Nigeria to Italy, from Ukraine to the United States, from Thailand to the Netherlands. Thus, modern abolitionists acknowledge the importance of international law in ending prostitution and trafficking.

## HISTORICAL AND CONTEMPORARY ABOLITIONIST MOVEMENTS

Today's movement against slavery has been informed by the seventeenth- and eighteenth-century abolitionists. The fight against slavery today includes the same problems: cultural and legal definitions, tolerance for injustice perpetrated against the marginalized and vulnerable, and outright denial. Regulationist laws were proposed to reduce the harms of slavery, if not

eliminate it. The argument was that a regulatory law was better than none at all. One such English law was passed in the eighteenth century over the objection of abolitionists. The bill proposed to limit the number of slaves based on a ship's weight, to require every ship to have a doctor, and to record all crew and slave deaths. Many abolitionists feared that the bill would establish "the Principle that the Trade was in itself just but had been abused."<sup>115</sup> A similar harm reduction approach is seen today in public health programs that fail to provide escape from prostitution, although they improve medical care by distributing condoms.<sup>116</sup> There is a parallel debate today regarding the legalization or regulation of prostitution. It is widely but incorrectly assumed that prostitution is inevitable, just as proponents once argued that US slavery was inevitable. Legal prostitution is said to be safer than illegal prostitution, although much evidence to the contrary exists in Australia, the Netherlands, Germany, and Nevada.<sup>117</sup>

For political reasons, a narrowed definition of slavery was used during the fight for the abolition of chattel slavery. In order to pass the Thirteenth Amendment, the original and broader definitions of slavery as economic injustice and discriminatory and exploitive abuse of women were excluded. Moderate abolitionists chose to define the differences between chattel slavery and other injustices as differences in kind, not degree.<sup>118</sup>

Once chattel slavery was abolished, labor activists and suffragists sought to revive the older, broader concept of "slavery." But emancipation allowed defenders of the status quo to insist that American society was now "free." Everyday aspects of economic and family life could not be "slavery," which was by definition the worst of evils and had already been eradicated by law. Even today, calling an injustice "slavery" is generally seen as overheated hyperbole and even a presumptuous insult to the memory of the victims of African American chattel slavery.<sup>119</sup>

Despite this focus on the most extreme type of slavery, the early abolitionists did not focus exclusively on children, as too often happens in the modern antislavery movement. Instead, they focused on the institution of slavery itself, which included both adults and children. In fact, the vast majority of children in prostitution, like children in slavery, are fully integrated into the mainstream sex industry, which serves all sex buyers, rather than in some isolated market niche catering to pedophiles.<sup>120</sup>

As in the past, some words are used to hide the truth. Just as torture is named "enhanced interrogation" and logging of old-growth forests is named the "Healthy Forest Initiative," words that lie about prostitution

leave people confused about what it really is: “flexible laborer,” “irregular migrant,” “sex worker,” “transnational migrant worker,” “erotic entrepreneur.” Human cruelties are placed into separate categories that imply they are unrelated phenomena; for example, “voluntary” is juxtaposed with “forced” prostitution. These falsehoods about prostitution are much like attempts to cover up what Patterson called the “beastliness” of slavery.<sup>121</sup> Slavery is presented as paternalistic, protective. Pimps are said to be protectors. Just as enslaved women trafficked into prostitution (for example, from Albania to Italy) are described as “migrant sex workers,” so, also, African slave traders delivered people who were described as “recruits” or “volunteers” to the European slave traders.

In the eighteenth century, the British moved enslaved Africans to sugar plantations in the West Indies. The proslavery West India Committee consisted of two overlapping interest groups: slave traders and ship owners who transported and sold the slaves and the influential plantation owners who bought them. This lobbying alliance spent millions on proslavery propaganda. At one point, they offered tours to visitors to the West Indies, showing them the homes of the elite slaves, drivers, carpenters, and masons, rather than the crowded quarters of the field slaves. They also used words to hide the reality of slavery, at one point suggesting that slaves be called “assistant planters.”<sup>122</sup>

Like the global prostitution industry, the slave system was strengthened by myths and lies. While Belgian King Leopold was colonizing, enslaving, torturing, and murdering millions of Congolese on rubber plantations in the eighteenth century, he was also president of the Aborigine Protection Society.<sup>123</sup> Leopold hosted an antislavery conference in 1889, posing as a humanitarian who was building infrastructure in the Congo—roads, railways, steamboats—all of which was used by his troops to pursue new and escaped slaves.<sup>124</sup> The Belgian king formed the International African Association of the Congo, a political entity that covered up his real activities. This was a calculated lie, because at the time, there was a philanthropic organization named the International African Association. Leopold instructed his aides, “Care must be taken not to let it be obvious that the Association of the Congo and the International African Association are two different things. The public doesn’t grasp that.”<sup>125</sup> After English abolitionists published exposés of the conditions of slavery in Leopold’s Congo, he counterattacked with a musical play, *The Benevolent Planters*, in which two black lovers, separated from each other in Africa, end up living on adjoining plantations in the West Indies. They are reunited and saved from the African darkness by their kindly owners. On another occasion, slave ship

owners argued that “the most crowded ships [was] the most healthy” and that “the time passed on board a ship while transporting from Africa to the colonies, [was] the happiest part of a negro’s life.”<sup>126</sup>

Similar cover-ups have been deployed in opposition to the twentieth-century abolitionist movement. Sex industry apologists calculatedly appropriate the titles of human rights or public health organizations. For example, although the names are similar, the Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women (GAATW) promotes prostitution as sex work, whereas the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW) works for the abolition of prostitution and other forms of discrimination against women.

When the ideological camouflage is removed from slavery, a crisis occurs.<sup>127</sup> “The victim who is able to articulate the situation of the victim has ceased to be a victim: she has become a threat.”<sup>128</sup> When the activities of pimps, traffickers, and men who buy sex are exposed, it becomes clear that a devalued class of women has been set aside for men’s sexual use. And it becomes clear that the activities of the sex buyers and sellers are predatory in the extreme.

Autobiographical descriptions of what slavery was really like were powerful weapons of the abolitionists. These slave narratives exposed the elaborate lies of the slave traders. Today, the abolitionist battle, like the sex trade itself, is located on the Internet. Most prostitution today—some estimates are as high as 90 percent—is advertised on the Internet, which functions as a virtual auction block. This electronic sex market serves as a floodgate controlling the supply of women and children for prostitution tourism and commercial marriages—both, forms of slavery.<sup>129</sup> Sex worker blogs—“secret diaries” of escorts and call girls—abound, designed to promote prostitution as a positive job choice. Pimps do not call themselves pimps—they call themselves “sex workers.”<sup>130</sup>

The response to lies about prostitution also happens online. Survivors of prostitution and trafficking have begun to counter these myths and distortions with narratives on their own Internet sites. Those who challenge the disinformation promoted by the sex industry advocates are verbally attacked, even threatened. Formerly prostituted in a Mafia-owned New York brothel, activist Stella Marr wrote:

I had no idea how threatening my voice was until I started to make it heard. None of us trafficking and prostitution survivors did, until we started to write about the brutality we’ve experienced and these big players within these pimp-dominated “sex worker activist” groups started to do everything they could to silence us and deny we exist. Survivor bloggers are cyber-stalked

## MELISSA FARLEY

via Facebook, email, Twitter, and hateful blog comments. Our email accounts are hacked and private information that could endanger us is tweeted or revealed elsewhere online. Spiteful emails about us are sent to people we work with. Supportive activists who feature our writing on their blogs are similarly swarmed with vilifying emails and comments.<sup>131</sup>

Slaves who resisted or spoke out against slavery were tortured and/or killed. Women in prostitution who resist or speak out are often treated similarly. In 2011, pimps tortured and killed a woman in front of another woman to frighten the survivor and her friends into cooperating with the traffickers.<sup>132</sup> In slavery, masters tortured, raped, and punished black women who rejected their sexual advances. In prostitution, women who resist the orders of pimps/traffickers and many of those who resist johns are tortured. Aileen Wuornos, an emotionally harmed and disturbed woman, killed six men who had raped and tortured her (of the thousands who used her for sex in prostitution). She was executed by the state of Florida.<sup>133</sup>

## CONCLUSION

The failure to undo the legacies of slavery is a continuation of the degradation of human life caused by slavery.<sup>134</sup> “Following the Civil War little changed for African Americans as white plantation owners turned to violence, legal constraints, and debt peonage to keep African Americans impoverished and trapped in the fields. They were slaves in all but name.”<sup>135</sup> Pimp-controlled prostitution today is characterized by the same violence, legal constraints, and debt peonage that occurred following the Civil War. Pimp-controlled prostitution—estimated at 84 percent of all prostitution—continues as one form of slavery today, yet most prostitution of adults is still not recognized as slavery.<sup>136</sup>

The legacies of the enslavement of indigenous peoples in the United States that occurred during their colonization by English settlers also continues with pervasive trafficking of Native women and the same violence, cultural degradation, and lack of adequate legal response.<sup>137</sup> Women have few options for escape. Without financial, emotional, and political support to permit healing, even out of prostitution, people cannot avoid the various iterations of modern slavery, including prostitution.<sup>138</sup> Modern-day slaveholders no longer legally own slaves, but they continue to exploit and benefit from womens’ and children’s poverty, which channels people into prostitution.<sup>139</sup> It seems that apologists for prostitution are stuck in their own illogic. In their support for prostitution, they have at the same time rejected opposition to all

the elements that constitute slavery: exploitation, sex trafficking, violence, commodification, and lack of freedom.<sup>140</sup> In order to reverse the human rights violations of trafficking, we must first define the buying of sex as a serious criminal act. Antiprostitution laws should be enforced against sex buyers *but not* against women who are sold for sex and are themselves victims of trafficking, as in the 1999 Swedish law.<sup>141</sup> Public education is needed regarding the humanity of the bought, the devastation in the experience of being bought for sex, and the criminality of the buyer, not the seller, of sex.

It is necessary to look at the structural origins of social injustice in order to challenge the human rights violations of slavery and prostitution. If we ask the question “What freedom do trafficked, pimped, or enslaved women have?” then we are more likely to focus on the essential sex, race, and economic inequalities on which slavery and prostitution are built.<sup>142</sup> Unless *both* the intrinsic violence of prostitution *and* the intersection of sexism, racism, and poverty in prostitution are understood, it is impossible to understand why abolitionists view prostitution as such a miserably oppressive institution. Former Swedish minister of gender equality Margareta Winberg asked, “Shall we accept the fact that certain women and children, primarily girls, often those who are most economically and ethnically marginalized, are treated as a lower class, whose purpose is to serve men sexually?”<sup>143</sup> Anthony Gumbs, whose relatives were enslaved, objected to prostitution, which he understood as a version of slavery:

The current practice in Jamaica of the widespread use of the sanitised or politically correct terms “sex workers” when referring to prostitutes, and “sex industry” when referring to prostitution, sends a clear message of a trend towards acceptance or legitimisation, if not outright legalisation. Jamaicans have had a long, hard history of brave struggle and sacrifice to lift our people out of the quagmires of slavery, poverty, indignity, ignorance, and exploitation. Are we ready to give up now? Surely those who must earn their living by renting their genitals, instead of by using their brains or hands, are little better off than the slaves of yore in terms of human dignity. Is this what we want to be “accepted”...in our beautiful home called Jamaica? Is this what we want for any of our people?<sup>144</sup>

Gumbs and Winberg challenge all of us to answer those questions, informed by an understanding of the history of slavery and the facts about prostitution.

Notes

1. Thomas Clarkson, *The History of the Rise, Progress, and Accomplishment of the Abolition of the Slave-Trade, by the British Parliament* (London: British Parliament, 1839), accessed November 25, 2013, <http://www.gutenberg.org/files/10633/10633-h/10633-h.htm>.
2. For the past eighteen years, the author, a research and clinical psychologist, has studied prostitution and trafficking in ten countries on five continents. Twenty-four peer-reviewed publications have resulted from this work.
3. According to a survey of eighteen sources, including research studies and governmental and nongovernmental reports, on average, 84 percent of all women in prostitution are pimped, trafficked, or under third-party control. Melissa Farley, Kenneth Franzblau, and M. Alexis Kennedy, "Online Prostitution and Trafficking," *Albany Law Review* 77, no. 3 (2014), fn.
4. Catherine M. Cameron, "Captives and Culture Change: Implications for Archaeology," *Current Anthropology* 52, no. 2 (April 2011): 169–209.
5. Christopher Clausen, "Between Two Worlds: The Familiar Story of Pocahontas Was Mirrored by That of a Young Englishman Given as a Hostage to Her Father," *American Scholar* 76, no. 3 (Summer 2007): 80–90.
6. Bay Fang and Mark Leong, "China's Stolen Wives," *U.S. News & World Report* 125, no. 14 (1998): 35.
7. Jacqueline A. M. Lynne, "Street Prostitution as Sexual Exploitation in First Nations Women's Lives," master's thesis, University of British Columbia–Vancouver, 1998.
8. James F. Brooks, *Captives and Cousins: Slavery, Kinship, and Community in the Southwest Borderlands* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002).
9. *Ibid.*, 364.
10. Sexism and Eurocentric cultural prejudice taint colonial history such that prostitution was assumed when it often did not exist. European colonists surmised that Native women who had sex outside of marriage were prostituting. A woman selling vegetables was presumed by one colonist to also be selling sex. Gray Whaley, *Oregon and the Collapse of Illahee: US Empire and the Transformation of an Indigenous World, 1792–1859* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010), 49.
11. Chris Hedges and Joe Sacco, *Days of Destruction, Days of Revolt* (New York: Nation Books, 2012), 192, citing Edward R. Murrow and Fred W. Friendly's November 26, 1960, *CBS News* report "Harvest of Shame."
12. Rebecca Mead, "Letter from Nevada—American Pimp—How to Make an Honest Living from the Oldest Profession," *New Yorker*, April 23, 2001.



13. Melissa Farley et al., "Comparing Sex Buyers with Men Who Don't Buy Sex: 'You Can Have a Good Time with the Servitude' vs. 'You're Supporting a System of Degradation'" (paper, Psychologists for Social Responsibility Annual Meeting, Boston, July 15, 2011).
14. Melissa Farley, "'Renting an Organ for 10 Minutes': What Tricks Tell Us about Prostitution, Pornography, and Trafficking," in *Pornography: Driving the Demand for International Sex Trafficking*, ed. David Guinn and J. DeCaro (Los Angeles: Captive Daughters Media, 2007), 145.
15. Lesley Sharp, "The Commodification of the Body and Its Parts," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 29, no. 1 (2000): 287–328.
16. Michael Serrill, "Prostitution: Defiling the Children," *Time* 141, no. 25 (June 21, 1993): 52–55.
17. Julia O'Connell Davidson, *Prostitution, Power, and Freedom* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1998).
18. John Stoltenberg, "Male Sexuality: Why Ownership Is Sexy," *Michigan Journal of Gender and Law* 1 (1993): 61.
19. Edward E. Baptist, "'Cuffy,' 'Fancy Maids,' and 'One-Eyed Men': Rape, Commodification, and the Domestic Slave Trade in the United States," *American Historical Review* 106 (December 2001): 1633.
20. Walter Johnson, *Soul by Soul: Life inside the Antebellum Slave Market* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999).
21. Chester Brown, *Paying for It: A Comic-Strip Memoir about Being a John* (Montreal: Drawn and Quarterly Press, 2011).
22. Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982).
23. Sixteen-year-old Jessenia Ramirez from San Jose, Costa Rica, eloquently explained how she felt while prostituting. James Varney, "Child Prostitution Is a Flourishing Business in Costa Rica, a Business Some Activists Are Trying to Stamp Out," *New Orleans Times-Picayune*, May 7, 2000, A1.
24. Barbara Omolade, "Hearts of Darkness," in *Powers of Desire: The Politics of Sexuality*, ed. Ann Snitow, Christine Stansell, and Sharon Thompson (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1983), 354.
25. Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death*.
26. Andrea Dworkin, "Prostitution and Male Supremacy," in *Life and Death*, ed. Andrea Dworkin (New York: Free Press, 1997), 139–151.
27. O'Connell Davidson, *Prostitution, Power, and Freedom*.
28. Johnson, *Soul by Soul*, 213.

MELISSA FARLEY

29. Melissa Farley et al., "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder," in *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, ed. Melissa Farley (New York: Routledge, 2003), 33–74.
30. Frederick Douglass and Harriet Jacobs, *Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an American Slave, and Incidents in the Life of a Slave Girl* (New York: Modern Library, 2000).
31. Claude Jaget, *Prostitutes—Our Life* (Bristol, UK: Falling Wall Press, 1980).
32. Johnson, *Soul by Soul*.
33. Ceilie Hoigard and Liv Finstad, *Backstreets: Prostitution, Money, and Love* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1986).
34. John W. Blassingame, *Slave Testimony: Two Centuries of Letters, Speeches, Interviews, and Autobiographies* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1977).
35. Blassingame, *Slave Testimony*.
36. Evelina Giobbe, "Juvenile Prostitution: Profile of Recruitment," in *Child Trauma: Issues and Research*, ed. Ann W. Burgess (New York: Garland Publishing, 1992), 126.
37. Klan report cited in Lisa Cardyn, "Sexualized Racism/Gendered Violence: Outraging the Body Politic in the Reconstruction South," *Michigan Law Review* 100, no. 4 (2002): 742.
38. Diana Paton, "Enslaved Women and Slavery before and after 1807," *History in Focus*, issue 12 (Spring 2007), Institute of Historical Research, University of London, <http://www.history.ac.uk/ihr/Focus/Slavery/articles/paton.html>.
39. Patricia M. Lambert, "Infectious Disease among Enslaved African Americans at Eaton's Estate, Warren County, North Carolina, ca. 1830–1850," *Memórias do Instituto Oswaldo Cruz, Rio de Janeiro* 101, suppl. 2 (2006): 107–117.
40. Calvin Schermerhorn, "The Everyday Life of Enslaved People in the Antebellum South," *OAH Magazine of History* 23, no. 2 (April 2009): 31–36.
41. Lambert, "Infectious Disease among Enslaved."
42. Melissa Farley et al., "Prostitution: Health Consequences of Physical Violence and Psychological Trauma" (paper, Eleventh International Congress on Women's Health Issues, University of California College of Nursing, San Francisco, January 28, 2000).
43. Douglass and Jacobs, *Narrative of the Life*, 147.
44. Anonymous woman who prostituted, interview by Melissa Farley, 2002.
45. Melissa Farley, "Prostitution and the Invisibility of Harm," *Women & Therapy* 26, nos. 3–4 (2005): 247–280.
46. Baptist, "'Cuffy,' 'Fancy Maids,' and 'One-Eyed Men.'"
47. Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death*.
48. Michael Martinez, "Prostitution Ring in Madrid Tattooed Nineteen-Year-Old

Woman with Bar Code,” *CNN World*, March 24, 2012, accessed May 2, 2012, [http://articles.cnn.com/2012-03-24/world/world\\_europe\\_spain-prostitution-tattoo\\_1\\_prostitution-ring-ring-leader-bar-code?\\_s=PM:EUROPE](http://articles.cnn.com/2012-03-24/world/world_europe_spain-prostitution-tattoo_1_prostitution-ring-ring-leader-bar-code?_s=PM:EUROPE).

49. Baptist, “‘Cuffy,’ ‘Fancy Maids,’ and ‘One-Eyed Men.’”

50. Johnson, *Soul by Soul*, 206.

51. Bridget Anderson and Julia O’Connell Davidson, *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A Multi-country Pilot Study* (Geneva: International Organization for Migration, 2003), 24.

52. Council for Prostitution Alternatives, *Annual Report, 1991*, Portland, OR, 3.

53. Farley et al., *Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries*.

54. Terri L. Snyder, “Suicide, Slavery, and Memory in North America,” *Journal of American History* 97, no. 1 (2010): 39–62.

55. The passage of the Fugitive Slave Law of 1850 required anyone in the United States to assist in returning a fugitive slave to the owner. Evelina Giobbe also documents pimps’ captures of women escaping prostitution. See Evelina Giobbe, “An Analysis of Individual, Institutional, and Cultural Pimping,” *Michigan Journal of Gender and Law* 1, no. 1 (1993): 33–57.

56. Kevin Bales, “The Social Psychology of Modern Slavery,” *Scientific American* 286, no. 4 (April 2002): 80–87.

57. Cathy Zimmerman et al., *Stolen Smiles: A Summary Report on the Physical and Psychological Health Consequences of Women and Adolescents Trafficked in Europe* (London: London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, 2006), <http://www.lshtm.ac.uk/php/ghd/docs/stolensmiles.pdf>.

58. Johnson, *Soul by Soul*.

59. Harvey L. Schwartz, Jody Williams, and Melissa Farley, “Pimp Subjugation of Women by Mind Control,” in *Prostitution and Trafficking in Nevada: Making the Connections*, by Melissa Farley (San Francisco: Prostitution Research & Education, 2007), 49–84.

60. Schwartz, Williams, and Farley, “Pimp Subjugation of Women.”

61. Judith Herman, *Trauma and Recovery: The Aftermath of Violence from Domestic Violence to Political Terror* (New York: Basic Books, 1992); Harvey L. Schwartz, *Dialogues with Forgotten Voices: Relational Perspective on Child Abuse Trauma and Treatment of Dissociative Disorders* (New York: Basic Books, 2000); Schwartz, Williams, and Farley, “Pimp Subjugation of Women.”

62. Dee L. R. Graham, *Loving to Survive: Sexual Terror, Men’s Violence, and Women’s Lives* (New York: New York University Press, 1994).

63. Graham, *Loving to Survive*.

64. Baptist, “‘Cuffy,’ ‘Fancy Maids,’ and ‘One-Eyed Men.’”

MELISSA FARLEY

65. A. F. Scott, *Southern Lady: From Pedestal to Politics, 1830–1930* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970).

66. The popular cultural story of slavery is seen through the lens of economics, color, labor, and men's experiences. Women's experiences of slavery, like women's experiences of the Holocaust, have been minimized or ignored. Although women sometimes outnumbered men in the US enslaved population, they tended to be seen as mummies or privileged mistresses. Yet the US slave system depended on slaves as reproducible raw material, not just laborers. Women's reproductive systems were under the control of the slave buyer and seller. See JoAnn Wypijewski, "Reproductive Rights and the Long Hand of Slave Breeding," *The Nation*, March 21, 2012, accessed April 8, 2012, <http://www.thenation.com/article/166961/reproductive-rights-and-long-hand-slave-breeding>.

67. Omolade, "Hearts of Darkness," 354.

68. Anonymous pimp, interview by Melissa Farley for a research study on prostitution, Chicago, 2007.

69. United Nations, Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1465 U.N.T.S. 85, December 10, 1984.

70. Catherine Clinton, *The Plantation Mistress: Woman's World in the Old South* (New York: Pantheon, 1982); Angela Davis, "Reflections on the Black Woman's Role in the Community of Slaves," *The Black Scholar* 3, no. 4 (1971): 2–15; Douglass and Jacobs, *Narrative of the Life*; Thelma Jennings, "Us Colored Women Had to Go Through a Plenty: Sexual Exploitation of African American Slave Women," *Journal of Women's History* 1 (Winter 1990): 45–74.

71. Kathleen Barry, *Female Sexual Slavery* (New York: New York University Press, 1979); Dworkin, "Prostitution and Male Supremacy"; Giobbe, "An Analysis of Individual, Institutional, and Cultural Pimping"; Hoigard and Finstad, *Backstreets*.

72. For a discussion of international legal definitions of torture as the same as acts commonly perpetrated against women in prostitution, see Melissa Farley, "Prostitution, Trafficking, and Cultural Amnesia: What We Must *Not* Know in Order to Keep the Business of Sexual Exploitation Running Smoothly," *Yale Journal of Law and Feminism* 18 (2006): 109–144.

73. Steve Lopez, "The 'Repugnant, Vile Truth' about Sex Trafficking in L.A. County," *Los Angeles Times*, August 31, 2013, accessed September 10, 2013, <http://www.latimes.com/local/la-me-0901-lopez-prostitution-20130901,0,4024210.column51>.

74. Kristian Williams, *American Methods: Torture and the Logic of Domination* (Cambridge: South End Press, 2006).

75. Human Rights Watch, *No Escape: Male Rape in US Prisons* (New York: Human Rights Watch, 2001).

76. Catharine A. MacKinnon, *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989).
77. Joanna Bourke, "Torture as Pornography," *London Guardian*, May 7, 2004, accessed May 20, 2004, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/women/story/0,3604,1211261,00.html>.
78. Neal K. Katyal, "Men Who Own Women: A Thirteenth Amendment Critique of Forced Prostitution," *Yale Law Journal* 103 (December 1993): 791.
79. See, for example, Nicole Constable, "International Marriage Brokers, Cross-Border Marriages, and the US Anti-trafficking Campaign," *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 38, no. 7 (2012): 1137–1154; Denise Brennan, *What's Love Got to Do with It? Transnational Desires and Sex Tourism in the Dominican Republic* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004); Svati Shah, *Street Corner Secrets: Sex, Work, and Migration in the City of Mumbai* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014).
80. Farley, Franzblau, and Kennedy, "Online Prostitution and Trafficking."
81. Elizabeth Fry Society of Toronto, "Streetwork: Outreach with Adult Female Street Prostitutes" (unpublished report, Toronto, May 1987); Farley et al., "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries."
82. Farley et al., "Comparing Sex Buyers."
83. Christa Wichterich, *The Globalized Woman* (North Melbourne: Spinifex Press, 2002).
84. Melissa Farley, *Prostitution and Trafficking in Nevada: Making the Connections* (San Francisco: Prostitution Research & Education, 2007).
85. Ine Vanwesenbeeck, *Prostitutes' Well-Being and Risk* (Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1994).
86. Cameron, "Captives and Culture Change."
87. "Fla. Woman Allegedly Offers Sex for Two Cheeseburgers," *Bradenton Herald* (FL), April 3, 2012, accessed May 22, 2012, <http://thetimes-tribune.com/news/fla-woman-offers-sex-for-2-cheeseburgers-1.1294528>.
88. Nathan Hardin, "Woman Charged with Prostituting for Gas," *Salisbury Post* (NC), July 21, 2011, accessed January 15, 2012, <http://www.salisburypost.com/Crime/072111-WEBcouplechargedwithprostitution-qcdChristopher%20Riddle>.
89. Whaley, *Oregon and the Collapse*, 174.
90. Catharine A. MacKinnon, "Prostitution and Civil Rights," *Michigan Journal of Gender and Law* 1 (1993): 23–24.
91. Melissa Farley, Nicole Matthews, Sarah Deer, Guadalupe Lopez, Christine Stark, and Eileen Hudon, *Garden of Truth: The Prostitution and Trafficking of Native Women in Minnesota* (report sponsored by Minnesota Indian Women's Sexual Assault Coalition and presented at William Mitchell College of Law, Saint Paul, MN, October 27, 2011).

**MELISSA FARLEY**

92. Elaine Scarry, *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), 157.

93. Pieter C. Smit, "Slavery on World Bank Projects Mauritania," November 27, 2002, [https://openlibrary.org/works/OL5293036W/Slavery\\_on\\_World\\_Bank\\_projects\\_in\\_Mauritania](https://openlibrary.org/works/OL5293036W/Slavery_on_World_Bank_projects_in_Mauritania).

94. Douglass and Jacobs, *Narrative of the Life*, 167.

95. Elinor Burkett, "God Created Me to Be a Slave," *New York Times Magazine*, October 12, 1997, 56–60.

96. Rachel Harris and Katharine Gelber, "Defining 'De Facto' Slavery in Australia: Ownership, Consent, and the Defence of Freedom," *International Criminal Law Review* 11, no. 3 (June 2011): 561–578.

97. Hedges and Sacco, *Days of Destruction*.

98. Jack M. Balkin and Sanford Levinson, "The Dangerous Thirteenth Amendment," *Columbia Law Review* 112 (2012): 1459.

99. MacKinnon, "Prostitution and Civil Rights."

100. Ibid.

101. Margaret Baldwin, "Strategies of Connection: Prostitution and Feminist Politics," *Michigan Journal of Gender and Law* 1, no. 1 (1993): 72.

102. US Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report* (Washington, DC, June 2007), <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/82902.pdf>.

103. US Department of Justice, U.S. Code Title 18, Chap. 77, Sects. 1581, 1584, 1589, 1590, and 1591, 2012, <http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/crm/1581fn.php>.

104. US Department of Justice, U.S. Code Title 18.

105. Farley, Franzblau, and Kennedy, "Online Prostitution and Trafficking," fn. 14.

106. The United Nations 1949 convention declared that trafficking and prostitution are incompatible with individual dignity and worth. The convention addressed the harms of prostitution to consenting adult women, whether transported across national boundaries or not. The UN convention defined slavery as "the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised." The slave trade was defined to include "all acts involved in the capture, acquisition or disposal of a person with intent to reduce him to slavery; all acts involved in the acquisition of a slave with a view to selling or exchanging him; all acts of disposal by sale or exchange of a slave acquired with a view to being sold or exchanged, and, in general, every act of trade or transport in slaves." United Nations Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, 96 U.N.T.S. 271, December 1949, <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/TrafficInPersons.aspx>.

107. Janice G. Raymond, "The New UN Trafficking Protocol," *Women's Studies International Forum* 25, no. 5 (2002): 491.
108. United Nations, Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, 1998, [http://legal.un.org/icc/statute/99\\_corr/cstatute.htm](http://legal.un.org/icc/statute/99_corr/cstatute.htm). The United States is not one of the 139 signatories to the ICC.
109. United Nations, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights Aspects of the Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, Commission on Human Rights, UN Doc. E/CN.4/2006/62, February 20, 2006, 7, 9, 17.
110. Seo-Young Cho, Axel Dreher, and Eric Neumayer, "Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking?" *World Development* 41, no. 1 (2013): 67–82.
111. Max Waltman, "Prohibiting Sex Purchasing and Ending Trafficking: The Swedish Prostitution Law," *Michigan Journal of International Law* 33 (2011): 133–157, and "Sweden's Prohibition of Purchase of Sex: The Law's Reasons, Impact, and Potential," *Women's Studies International Forum* 5 (2011): 449–474.
112. Harris and Gelber, "Defining 'De Facto' Slavery in Australia."
113. *Ibid.*
114. Benjamin Skinner, *A Crime So Monstrous* (New York: Free Press, 2009).
115. Adam Hochschild, *Bury the Chains: Prophets and Rebels in the Fight to Free an Empire's Slaves* (New York: Houghton-Mifflin, 2005).
116. Harm reduction programs such as free condom distribution (of female and male condoms) can save lives, but these programs' advocates often suggest that this Band-Aid solution is sufficient. Programs that offer support groups and condoms but fail to offer exit programs contribute to a denial of the harms of prostitution. Almost all women in prostitution seek the option of escape, as well as free condoms and emotional support. In addition to the option of harm reduction, they deserve the right to harm elimination (by leaving prostitution). Parallels with slavery are evident: although improved medical care for the enslaved was welcomed, abolition of slavery was preferable.
117. Mary L. Sullivan, *Making Sex Work: A Failed Experiment with Legalized Prostitution* (North Melbourne: Spinifex Press, 2007); Farley, *Prostitution and Trafficking in Nevada*.
118. Balkin and Levinson, "The Dangerous Thirteenth Amendment," 37. Restricting the definition of slavery to its worst manifestation—the evil of chattel slavery—has been compared by Balkin and Levinson to John Yoo's infamous definition of "torture" as requiring a degree of pain and debilitation equal to facing the risk of death or organ failure. Certainly, the conditions Yoo described are understood to be torture. The problem is that Yoo felt his definition was complete whereas others think that many types of torture do not approach risking death or organ failure. Many of

MELISSA FARLEY

these are psychological torture. Similarly, chattel slavery does not exhaust the meaning of slavery.

119. Balkin and Levinson, "The Dangerous Thirteenth Amendment," 40.

120. About 14 percent of all slaves sent by the British to the New World were children under the age of fourteen from Senegambia and Sierra Leone. About twice as many men were enslaved compared with women; see Herbert S. Klein, *The Atlantic Slave Trade* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 165.

121. Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death*.

122. Hochschild, *Bury the Chains*, 160.

123. Adam Hochschild, *King Leopold's Ghost: A Story of Greed, Terror, and Heroism in Colonial Africa* (Boston: Houghton-Mifflin, 1998).

124. *Ibid.*

125. *Ibid.*

126. Hochschild, *Bury the Chains*.

127. Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death*.

128. James Baldwin, *The Devil Finds Work* (New York: Dial Press, 1976).

129. Wichterich, *The Globalized Woman*.

130. Examples of pimping masqueraded as sex work include Margo St. James, Robyn Few, Maxine Doogan, and Norma Jean Almodovar. All of these individuals have mounted campaigns to legalize the sex industry. St. James was convicted of running a disorderly house or a brothel in 1962. Robyn Few founded the Sex Workers' Outreach Project after being convicted of conspiracy to promote interstate prostitution. The Erotic Service Providers Union is led by Maxine Doogan, who has been convicted of running an escort prostitution agency. The executive director of COYOTE/Los Angeles, Norma Jean Almodovar, was convicted of pandering. Stella Marr, "Pimps Will Be Pimps, Part 2," *The Survivor's View Blog*, June 28, 2012, [http://prostitutionresearch.com/pre\\_blog/2012/06/28/pimps\\_will\\_be\\_pimps\\_part\\_2\\_of/](http://prostitutionresearch.com/pre_blog/2012/06/28/pimps_will_be_pimps_part_2_of/).

131. Marr, "Pimps Will Be Pimps."

132. Christine Roberts, "Victim of Torture Murder in Oklahoma May Have Been Alive When She Was Dismembered," *New York Daily News*, July 25, 2012, accessed July 30, 2012, <http://www.nydailynews.com/news/national/victim-torture-murder-oklahoma-alive-dismembered-article-1.1121416#ixzz254a87p00>.

133. Phyllis Chesler, "A Woman's Right to Self-Defense: The Case of Aileen Carol Wuornos," *St. John's Law Review* 66, no. 4 (Fall-Winter 1993): 933-977.

134. Orlando Patterson, *The Ordeal of Integration* (Washington, DC: Counterpoint, 1997).

135. Hedges and Sacco, *Days of Destruction*, 195.

136. Farley, Franzblau, and Kennedy, "Online Prostitution and Trafficking," fn. 14.



137. See Sarah Deer, chapter 10 in this volume.

138. Today there is a lack of services for those who want to escape prostitution and in particular a lack of culturally relevant services, for example, for African American and Native American women escaping prostitution. Women of color continue to be arrested more often and given longer criminal sentences than other women in prostitution.

Vednita Nelson, "Prostitution: Where Racism and Sexism Intersect," *Michigan Journal of Gender and Law* 1 (1993): 81–89. Once in prostitution, African American women have more difficulty escaping it, largely a result of a lack of resources for them. African American homeless young adults were significantly more likely to be prostituted than white Euro-Americans. Kimberly Tyler, "Risk Factors for Trading Sex among Homeless Young Adults," *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 38, no. 2 (2009): 290–297. There is an urgent need for trauma-informed services, especially for young women of color.

139. A man in debt bondage earned enough money to be free from a hereditary slave system in India but then returned to slavery because he was overwhelmed with the fear that he could not care for his family if they became sick or if he could not find food. Bales, "The Social Psychology of Modern Slavery."

140. Kajsia E. Ekman, *Being and Being Bought: Prostitution, Surrogacy, and the Split Self* (North Melbourne: Spinifex Press, 2013).

141. Waltman, "Prohibiting Sex Purchasing" and "Sweden's Prohibition."

142. Harris and Gelber, "Defining 'De Facto' Slavery."

143. Melissa Farley, "Unequal," Prostitution Research & Education, 2005, <http://prostitutionresearch.com/2005/09/13/unequal/>.

144. Anthony G. Gumbs, "Prostitution: A Return to Slavery," *Jamaica Gleaner*, April 24, 2006, accessed April 26, 2006, <http://www.jamaicagleaner.com/gleaner/20060424/letters/letters1.html>.

